

HISTORIC AREA COMMISSION
New Castle Town Hall
2nd and Delaware Streets
June 17, 2010

Present: Sally Monigle, Chairperson
Doug Heckrotte
David Bird
Bill Hentkowski
Robin Hegvik

City Personnel: Jeff Bergstrom, Inspection Department

Mrs. Monigle called the meeting to order at 5:10 p.m. Roll call followed. She recognized Robin Hegvik for her services to this body for the past several years. Ms. Hegvik will be relocating and unable to continue her duties with HAC.

OLD APPLICATIONS

N. Bustamante, 315 Harmony Street

Final detail approval

Discussion: Commission members went on record expressing their displeasure with the fence installation. (*Members referred to previous HAC minutes addressing fence approval.*) The applicant had agreed to select a fence from the approved list that HAC provides. A question was raised about City enforcement concerning matters such as this.

New Castle Library, 424 Delaware Street

Consideration of exterior details for C.O. approval

Discussion: Corky Viola and Dave Dalby, architect, presented to the Commission. Ms. Monigle said the Commission still has some concerns to be addressed.

Action: Mr. Bird made a motion to vote on the application as submitted with the stipulation that there be landscaping (hedge) next to the fence on the public side (Delaware Street side) to hide the Bilco door, to change the sidewalk between the buildings on Delaware Street to have brick showing, the rectangular downspouts are acceptable and the sidewalk on Fifth Street can remain cement. Mr. Bird noted that he stated this purposely so the downspouts and the sidewalk along Fifth Street would not be considered a precedent. He had no comment about the handrails. Because of the particular circumstances they can remain as an exception to HAC's general guidelines. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Mr. Hentkowski noted that Mr. Viola is not pleased with the way a lot of things turned out with this building. The cost of the changes would be substantial and he does not believe we should put the library through such a costly endeavor. Perhaps in the future these items could be addressed, particularly the downspouts.

Mr. Dalby asked for clarification on the south sidewalk. A couple of options were discussed at the site (before this meeting). Is HAC saying it wants brick or are other options such as colored or stained concrete, brick pavers being considered. Ms. Monigle said that currently it is consistent with the brick sidewalk and if he keeps it cement and places brick pavers over it it is a possible option. It has to be an appropriate design and color. HAC would need to approve this. Mr. Dalby said they poured concrete at this area because they had a serious leak problem from the area into the Robinson House basement, which is at a higher level than the basement floor in the new building. We were having difficulty stopping water from getting into the old basement. The leak stopped completely when they poured the concrete sidewalk. Ms. Monigle said she would have a problem with anything that does not have a brick configuration. This is assuming that the concrete steps will become brick steps. Mr. Viola said this affects the Code interpretation. Mr. Bird said he would be fine with the concrete steps remaining with some kind of staining. *(Discussion followed.)* Ms. Monigle said she would like to work with the library on this matter. The applicant had no problem with this.

Disposition:

Mr. Heckrotte abstained.

Mr. Hentkowski voted in favor of the motion.

Ms. Monigle voted in favor of the motion.

Ms. Hegvik voted in favor of the motion.

Mr. Bird voted in favor of the motion.

The motion was approved by a vote of four in favor with one abstention.

Ms. Monigle noted that we are all sympathetic to the library project and the disagreements we have encountered are a result of HAC trying to uphold its responsibility to the community as you (applicant) are trying to do the same.

Ms. Hegvik added that this project was a huge undertaking and she hopes that the library appreciates HAC's opinions/concerns and that everything that comes through this body can create precedent.

NEW APPLICATIONS

J. Day, 100 W. 3rd Street

Construct (on 2 lots) single family home

Discussion: The owners and builder/architect presented a plot plan/architectural rendering to Commission members. Mr. Bird inquired about scale of this house compared to adjacent homes. Danny Burris, builder, said the scale fits in other than the peak of the roof. Ms. Monigle asked where the front porch line is located in relation to the neighbor noting this has been an issue on 3rd Street in the event the

street is ever widened. The applicant is back far enough. Mr. Heckrotte said they are building over the rear set-back lot by about 5 feet. Mr. Day said they do not have any intention of being beyond any set-backs. *(There appears to be a discrepancy with the plans.)* Mr. Heckrotte said that what has been done previously is HAC requests a drawing showing elevation of neighboring homes so neighbors can see how tall this home will be compared to theirs and requested that drawing be provided. He also asked for a drawing showing the section through this house going across 3rd Street showing the house that is being constructed across the street. This will show HAC how high your house is as compared to homes across the street. He said there is one other house in town that has a front bump and a back bump which is similar to what is being asked for in this application. He suggested the applicant look at that house. Mr. Heckrotte is critical of the side elevation of the house being proposed citing it is not 'New Castleish'. He suggested tipping the front roof up steeper so it looks like an ordinary New Castle pitch of 8, 9, 10, 12 pitch then match the pitch along the back, make the apparent hyphen longer, then figure out what to do with the peak-like item on the garage. In New Castle you rarely see chimneys stuck on the outside of the building. Typically they don't show outside and he would like to see the chimney flush with the exterior.

Mr. Bird asked about the type of brick to be used on the house. They are using 52DD. Mr. Hentkowski asked what the dimensions for the house will be. Mr. Heckrotte also noted that typically long, rectangular homes are more acceptable when the apparent additions are narrower in plan so the front porch is prominent and the back of the house is stepped in a little (4" is fine but 8" is a good change). *(He further explained what is being requested.)* If the house is going to be done Colonial style, he suggested being consistent with details. He suggested using source materials to ensure consistency. Other items Mr. Heckrotte expressed concern with were the number of windows across the front versus the width of the house and more detail on the front door. *(Additional discussion followed.)* A working drawing is needed. He said that HAC will work with them and emphasized that HAC is not interested in holding the applicant up with his plans. HAC is required to keep the interests of the town at the forefront.

Action: No final action taken this evening. Applicant is welcome to submit information in between meetings and will return to HAC at a later date.

K. Wipf, 221 Harmony Street

Replace 9 windows and conceal extra front door.

Discussion: The applicant's brother appeared on her behalf. HAC's concern is historic preservation and the multi-pane windows should be replaced with 2 over 2. There may have been a pre-mature ordering of windows before this meeting. Ms. Monigle said the contractor gave the impression he did not want to have storm windows but have Pella historic replacement windows which include the storm window built in. The current windows are in good condition and are of the correct configuration and should remain. The applicant's brother said the applicant would be

fine with whatever window HAC suggests as long as they are energy efficient. Mr. Hentkowski said studies have been done showing no benefit to double-pane new windows over old windows that are tight and have been rebuilt, either inside or outside. He said the windows could be rebuilt because they don't appear to be in bad condition, with the exception of the side windows. Mr. Heckrotte stated he would like to see the original door to the house remain. Mr. Hentkowski said it has been walled over inside the building and not used. Ms. Monigle offered to meet with the applicant upon her return to go over HAC's concerns. HAC is interested in working with the applicant.

Action: The application was continued and local HAC members will meet with the applicant to explain its concerns.

J. Baker, 145 E. 2nd Street

Replace 7 windows and front door.

Discussion: The applicant has already done one-half the windows. Mr. Heckrotte does not believe approval should be granted for the door.

Action: With regard to replacement of the windows, Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. The windows were done the same as the previous windows. Mr. Bird seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion to approve the windows was approved by unanimous vote.

Action: With regard to the front door and two (2) side lights, Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to deny the request. The applicant must repair as they are or replace with exact duplicates. Mr. Bird seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion to deny approval of the front door and two (2) side lights was approved by unanimous vote.

A. Panayotti, 118 E. 3rd Street

Miscellaneous repointing

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted with the proviso that a local member of HAC look at a sample.

Disposition: The motion was approved unanimously.

J. Davidson, 27 The Strand

Repair and stucco chimneys

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved by unanimous vote.

V. Wollaston, 119-21 E. 4th Street

Replace (front section only) roof with weathered wood blend shingles.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved unanimously.

Good Will Fire Co., 401 South Street

Air conditioner condenser placement approval.

Discussion: Work already completed.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved by unanimous vote.

Immanuel Church, 100 Harmony Street

Build 4 cast-iron wall washers, star shape to stabilize the brick wall facing The Strand.

Discussion: Mr. Hunter Ficke presented on behalf of the church. He provided an overview of structural work done in the basement. In addition to that work structural engineers found that the Strand-facing façade of the building was beginning to drift away from the building. The intention is to stabilize in place by fastening wall washers between the windows on the second floor and the first floor, both at ceiling level. He described the procedure to be used. They are asking for approval for the exterior fixture to be used in stabilization. Discussion about the shape and size of the fixture to be used followed. The church does not have any preference. (*Discussion followed.*) Ms. Monigle is confident the church will select an appropriate fixture.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Ms. Hegvik seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was passed by unanimous vote.

B. Reynolds, 39 E. 4th Street

Remove and replace siding on front and north side.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted with the suggestion that the applicant use cedar or some other rot-resistant wood. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved by unanimous vote.

EMERGENCY REPAIRS

L. Ratchford, 24 The Strand

Main chimney (leaking) on 3rd floor roof. Repoint and replace brick with old bricks and add chimney cap if needed.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved by unanimous vote.

D. Sullivan, 132 E. 4th Street

Exterior oil tank placement approval

Discussion: Request for approval is via the realtor due to pending settlement.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was passed unanimously.

Historic Area Commission Minutes
June 17, 2010
Page 6

Approval of Minutes – Mr. Bird made a motion to approve the minutes of the 5/20/10 HAC meeting. Mr. Heckrotte seconded the motion which was then passed.

Adjournment -- There being no further business to address, Mr. Bird made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Hegvik seconded the motion and the meeting was adjourned at 6:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Debbie Turner

Debbie Turner, Stenographer