

HISTORIC AREA COMMISSION
New Castle Town Hall
2nd and Delaware Streets
May 19, 2011

Present: Sally Monigle, Chairperson
Dorsey Fiske
Bill Hentkowski
Tom McDowell

Absent: Doug Heckrotte

City Personnel: Jeff Bergstrom, City Building Inspector

Mrs. Monigle called the meeting to order at 5:10 p.m. Roll call followed.

OLD APPLICATIONS

J. Givens – 117 E. 2nd Street

Returning with garage and door drawings.

Discussion: No one was present.

F. Marini, 101 W. 3rd Street

Final details for C.O.

Discussion: Mr. Jay Freebery, builder, addressed the three outstanding issues from the last meeting. The roll locks have been resolved. He said he has obtained the latest drawing (received today) provided by the architect concerning the dormer details. It is not a “to-scale drawing.” It provides a flavor for what is being proposed and he will forward this drawing via email to Mr. Heckrotte. He is looking for direction from HAC on the dormer detail so he can go forward. Mr. Bergstrom reviewed the drawing that was received by Mr. Freebery. The sketch that was previously approved is reflected in the drawing. Mr. Freebery did request Mr. Heckrotte’s input as soon as possible.

Action: Mr. McDowell made a motion to approve the revised drawing for the dormer subject to Mr. Heckrotte’s review and approval. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: No vote taken on this motion.

Mr. Freebery revisited the issue of costs to move the door on the house. To do this work costs ranged from \$15,000-\$20,000. He described the work involved. In looking at houses around the city many houses in the historic district have doors that are off center from the windows. The difference is diminimous in appearance.

Mr. Hentkowski took a photo and counted the bricks between the windows and offered the distance from the center of the right window is about 4 inches more than the left window. When shutters are put up there will be a 4 inch difference between the spacing to windows on the second floor. The drawings do not show this difference. If the window is moved over then the distance from the outside of the window and the outside corner of the wall changes also because they aren’t the same. Ms. Fiske suggested moving the window as a cheaper alternative. Mr. Freebery said cutting brick increases costs.

Ms. Fiske reiterated these issues need to be done properly. Mrs. Marini said photos of over 50 historic buildings throughout New Castle show that every window, every door is slightly ascue. She objects to being told she is doing something incorrect when other historic structures in the city are built this way.

This issue has been in front of HAC for about 5 years and these drawings have been in front of this body for years. She has appeared before HAC a number of times for approvals throughout each step of construction. Ms. Monigle said there may have been a mistake with the original drawings that HAC looked at versus the construction drawings.

Mr. McDowell said HAC approved drawings for this home to be built and have approved construction drawings. It appears Mr. Heckrotte and Ms. Fiske are referring to a conceptual drawing. The house was built to the construction drawings.

Action: Mr. McDowell made a motion to accept the door, as is, with no changes to the plan. Ms. Fiske said Mr. Heckrotte should be consulted.

Ms. Monigle stated HAC approved the drawings that it had but HAC did not have the construction drawings when they approved the plan. She said everyone's intent was that the alignment of the door and window would be accurate. (*Discussion followed.*)

Ms. Monigle asked Mr. Freebery if he feels moving the door or adjusting the door trim does not help to solve the problem and he is unwilling to do this. He believes it will look worse aesthetically because it is off center on the sill and the door is not centered on the sill which will look worse. He then would have to cut and move the sill thus adding major expense.

Mr. Hentkowski raised the issue of aligning the window with the door and make spacing between the windows even. Mr. Freebery said he would still have to rebrick and believes it will look bad.

Mrs. Marini asked why these issues were not raised over her many appearances before HAC or over the last 6 months when the window and door openings were present. Ms. Fiske said HAC does not check things when they are in progress. Mrs. Marini countered that HAC has commented that it has checked the site.

Ms. Monigle agreed that a number of historic houses in the city are inaccurate and added HAC is thinking on the applicant's behalf. The façade of this house is very obvious. Mr. Freebery commented that most people will not notice any difference. He believes when railings, lights, shutters and paint are done it will not be noticeable. HAC members believe it will be more noticeable once that work is completed and the window is more problematic than the door.

There is a motion on the floor. Ms. Fiske does not believe HAC should vote on that particular motion. She reiterated she wants to get input from Mr. Heckrotte.

Action: As a point of order Mr. McDowell stated the Chair should ask for a second to his motion to accept the door as is and allow the applicant to proceed with obtaining a certificate of occupancy. Ms. Monigle asked for a second to the motion. No second was voiced and the motion died.

Action: A motion was made by Ms. Fiske to refer to Mr. Heckrotte for further advice in light of the material presented tonight (revised dormer drawing). Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion. Discussion can take place in between meetings. Mr. Freebery asked that Mr. Heckrotte be informed

that the cost for moving the door is \$15,000-\$20,000 and moving a window could be between \$10,000-\$15,000. He described the work involved with making these changes. It is his intent to request a certificate of occupancy at the next meeting. He reiterated he used drawings stamped by the city to build the house.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

Action: Ms. Fiske made a motion to provide all supporting documentation (cost estimates as requested by HAC, window and door location including the drawing showing shutters) to Mr. Heckrotte in between meetings for his input. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved by a vote of three in favor and one (McDowell) voting against. (Mr. Bergstrom will facilitate transferring information to Mr. Heckrotte.)

Mrs. Marini recognized everyone is working hard and she is trying to cooperate as much as possible. She noted that Ms. Fiske has been in frequent communications with Mr. (John) Wheeler regarding her home. Ms. Fiske said they were friends. Mrs. Marini requested Ms. Fiske recuse herself from further decisions concerning her home. Ms. Fiske refused and said she assisted Mr. Wheeler in making sure the city obeyed its rules. Ms. Monigle suggested referring this matter to the City Solicitor. Mrs. Marini is asking for fair treatment.

NEW APPLICATIONS

S. Woodruff, 27 E. 4th Street

Repair front porch and install railing.

Discussion: Both posts are damaged on the bottom and every effort will be made to use tapered posts. They are searching for appropriate materials to make the repairs.

Action: A motion was made by Mr. Hentkowski to vote on the application as submitted with the requirement that the posts be tapered to match what is there. Mr. McDowell seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

P. Flannigan, 166 E. 2nd Street

Remove and replace garage roof in kind.

Discussion: HAC questioned the trim around/underneath; the roof itself. The area is rotten. Mr. Bergstrom informed this application was an emergency; the roof was leaking.

Action: Mr. McDowell made a motion to accept the proposal as presented to replace the roof with the suggestion they also replace the fascia board that is rotten. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

P. Flannigan, 109 E. 3rd Street

Remove and replace roof.

Discussion: The roof was leaking and has been replaced.

Action: Mr. McDowell made a motion to accept the proposal as presented. Ms. Fiske seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

J. Moore, 179 E. 4th Street

Curb replacement; repair/replace brick sidewalk and drive.

Discussion: Types of curbing (grainy appearance desired) was discussed.

Action: Ms. Fiske made a motion to approve the repairs as designated. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

E. Doering, 414 Delaware Street

Remove and replace new shingles on main part of house.

Action: Ms. Fiske made a motion to approve the application. Mr. McDowell seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

A. Cronin, 123 Delaware Street

Repair bilco door, roof, windows and gutters. Remove back windows; install door and small deck in back yard.

Discussion: Photos of the front bilco doors were presented by the tenants. They plan to replace with the same kind of door. The rear roof coming from the third floor door is leaking. They plan to replace using the same materials. It is a flat roof. None of the jams on the windows exist. They want to replace with jam liners and keep the existing windows. No changes to exterior windows are being requested. Mr. Hentkowski is not familiar with what currently exists and expressed concern about the windows being correct. He suggested looking at the windows. They believe everything is accurate and according to code but welcomed Mr. Hentkowski's suggestion. They also request the repair/replacement of gutters in kind as needed. Smooth, round downspouts will be used. They also requested removal of the back bedroom window and installation of a door and small deck. They would like to remove the window and install a door to enable them easier access to the second floor from the ground level. The deck would be at the second floor level only. Ms. Fiske informed the Trustees of New Castle Common owns part of the back yard of this property. Discussion followed about whether a variance would be needed for a second-floor deck. Mr. Bergstrom informed the Board of Adjustment would need to be approached to build a small deck.

Action: Mr. McDowell made a motion that all items be accepted; the deck can be accepted provided an approval is provided by the Board of Adjustment. A drawing will be submitted to HAC. Ms. Fiske seconded the motion. Mr. Hentkowski questioned including all items, such as the addition, and suggested keeping the items separate. (*Discussion followed.*)

Action: Mr. McDowell modified his motion to read that the deck be removed from consideration until approved by the Board of Adjustment. The concept for a deck for convenience of moving items in/out of the house is approved and drawings must be submitted to HAC if the matter is referred to the Board of Adjustment.

Disposition: The motion as amended was approved.

Action: Ms. Fiske made a motion to approve repair of the gutters, windows, roof, front door and bilco. Mr. McDowell seconded the motion. Conditions include smooth, round downspouts, half round gutters, if any exterior trims are removed they be replaced in kind.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

EMERGENCY REPAIRS

R. Vukelich, 33 The Strand

Replace one 1-1/2 ton split system A/C unit in same location.

Action: Mr. McDowell made a motion to accept the application as presented. Ms. Fiske seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved by a vote of 3 in favor and 1 recusal (Hentkowski).

T. Cycle, 5 Shaw Alley

Replace roof w/weather wood blend shingles.

Action: Mr. Hentkowski made a motion to approve the application as submitted. Mr. McDowell seconded the motion.

Disposition: The motion was approved.

Minutes

April 2011 minutes – At the request of Mr. McDowell, procedural text was incorporated on page 2. There were no objections to his request. A motion was then made by Mr. McDowell to approve the April minutes with the correction noted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Hentkowski. The minutes were approved with the noted correction.

Old Business

Ms. Fiske noted the muntins and cellar window at 125 Delaware Street have not been addressed yet and there is another cellar window that has half muntins. Neither window is correct. Approval was given in November 2010 to install outside muntins from the factory and install with the proper glue. It was also approved that the cellar window could have a small hutch.

Adjournment -- There being no further business to address, a motion to adjourn the meeting was made and seconded. The meeting was adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Debbie Turner

Debbie Turner
Stenographer

(Minutes transcribed from recording; stenographer not present at meeting.)