

HISTORIC AREA COMMISSION
New Castle Town Hall
2nd and Delaware Streets
December 8, 2016

Present: Sally Monigle, Chairperson
David Baldini
Lynn Briggs
Bill Hentkowski
Jean Norvell

Also Present: Leila Hamroun, Architectural Consultant
Jeff Bergstrom, City Building Inspector

The meeting was convened at 6:38 p.m. Roll call followed.

OLD APPLICATION

M. Chaump, 155 E. 2nd Street

Exterior details (hand rails, windows, window details, porch railing, trim & siding, downspouts, gutters, roofing shingles) to be presented.

Discussion: Dave Dalby, architect presented for the applicants. Materials to be used:

Windows – Colby Heritage Series true-divided light; 2-inch sill case with a 3-½ inch brick molding.

Siding – lap siding similar to adjacent house; color of siding to be determined. They are using a recycled wood product. The proposed finish is textured. Mr. Hentkowski notes his preference would be for smooth. Applicant will confirm product and submit a sample of the proposed finish to HAC for review and final approval.

Porch railing – 2-inch X 2-inch vertical baluster with a traditional New Castle style.

Trim and window surrounds – white painted wood finish.

Gutters/Downspout -- ½-round aluminum with 4-inch diameter and smooth round downspout.

Front – existing shutters to be restored or replaced in kind.

Roof – Williams Slate Timberline shingle. A question was asked about the amount of roof and if the 4-inch half-round gutters are resized adequately. Mr. Dalby said it will be 6-inch visible trim at gable ends, painted white, using standard 1 X 8 boards.

Ms. Hamroun has no objections with the selection of materials to be used (true divided wood windows, engineered wood siding on new construction); her objection is with the scale of the project.

Mr. Hentkowski asked if the window trim will be painted. Mr. Dalby notes the windows are pre-primed and will be painted white. *(Sample of product shown to commissioners.)*

Mr. Hentkowski thinks the dormer fascia board is somewhat heavy. He asked if it will be the same as the rest of the fascia. Mr. Dalby responded in the affirmative, with some trim concealed by the roof overhang. Ms. Hamroun noted the drawing shows a more significant trim and suggests going with narrower trim for the dormers. Mr. Dalby has no objection.

Siding – Mr. Dalby said the siding is a grain board. It is not available in a smooth finish. A similar board has been used on an adjacent building. Ms. Hamroun thinks a smooth finish

may give a more artificial feel because of the large scale of flat façade area. The applicant will present samples of the proposed board for review. Ms. Hamroun recommends getting a larger sample to evaluate the texture.

Disposition: Mr. Baldini made a motion to approve the application as presented with the recommendation of narrower fascia trim at the dormers and presentation of samples of the wood siding. Ms. Norvell seconded the motion.

Action: Motion approved by a vote of 3 in favor and 1 against (Hentkowski).

NEW APPLICATIONS

210 Delaware Street -- M&T Bank

Install two new exterior light fixtures on front of building.

Discussion: Bill Moore, Property Manager, M&T Bank presented. Selected fixture is the one in keeping with the historic district while keeping with the bank's lighting levels. Ms. Hamroun met with Mr. Moore to look at the proposed fixture. She believes the light is too bright for the historic district. Ms. Hamroun added the fixtures are very big and not appropriate; they will also be intrusive during the day when the light is off. The level of lighting the bank would like to have is not appropriate because of the nature of the historic district. An alternative to get close to the desired levels would be to add an extra street lamp post and have two standard historic district fixtures on either side of the entrance, which will provide 1.5 foot candles. Ms. Hamroun stated the recommendation is to add a lamp post in front of the bank and more traditional fixtures on the sides of the door. Ms. Norvell said the existing lighting is unbalanced. Mr. Bergstrom will discuss the possibility of adding a lamp post with the City. Although HAC wants to be supportive of the bank, it cannot do so in a way that would significantly impact the street scape. Mr. Hamroun notes that the minutes will provide documentation for Mr. Moore that the national bank standards of 2 foot candles within 30 ft. of the entrance do not comply with the historic district guidelines.

HAC proposes a compromise of street lamp and a number of more appropriate wall-mounted fixtures.

Disposition: A motion was made for additional light posts to be installed by the City and light fixtures installed by the bank. The motion did not receive a second.

Disposition: A motion was made to deny the application as written. The motion was seconded.

Action: The motion to deny the application was approved.

OLD BUSINESS

M. Chaump, 155 E. 2nd Street

Mr. Hentkowski revisited discussion on this application. He said the graining of the siding will look fake and noted that Boral has a more natural graining. Ms. Hamroun will follow up with Mr. Dalby to inform him of HAC's concern about the siding.

145 E. 4th Street – Mr. Bergstrom asked commissioners if they approved hardy plank in concept only at this location. Ms. Hamroun noted that that would be acceptable if located in an area not visible from the public right-of-way and on a secondary structure.

Historic Area Commission Minutes – 12-8-16

Approval of Minutes – A motion was made and seconded to approve the minutes of the 11/10/16 meeting as distributed.

Adjournment -- There being no further business to address, the meeting was adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

Debbie Turner
Stenographer